

COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY  
IN THE CITY OF NEW YORK  
DEPARTMENT OF EARTH & ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENCES  
LAMONT DOHERTY EARTH OBSERVATORY

May 4, 2021

Prof. Stephen Parman  
Editor, JGR Solid Earth

Dear Steve,

With this letter, my co-authors and I are submitting a multi-authored paper, “*Mass transfer into the leading edge of the mantle wedge: Initial Results from Oman Drilling Project Hole BT1B*”.

If this paper is accepted, we are requesting that it be included in the Special Issue on Ophiolites and Oceanic Lithosphere.

We are suggesting that you handle this paper since you – as a petrologist – have a broad knowledge of the potential reviewing community and scientific issues.

We would like to recommend the following potential reviewers:

Philippe Agard, Sorbonne University <philippe.agard@upmc.fr>  
Greg Dipple, University of British Columbia <gdipple@eoas.ubc.ca>  
Carlos Garrido, Instituto Andaluz de Ciencias de la Tierra <carlos.garrido@csic.es>  
Bjørn Jamtveit, University of Oslo <bjorn.jamtveit@geo.uio.no>  
Frieder Klein, Woods Hole Oceanographic Institution fklein@whoi.edu  
Othmar Müntener, University of Lausanne <othmar.muntener@unil.ch>  
Oliver Plümper, University of Utrecht <O.Plumper@uu.nl>

We request that the paper not be sent for review to

Andreas Scharf, Christopher Bailey, Robert Bolhar, Frank Mattern or Uwe Ring, co-authors of a manuscript that Kelemen reviewed several times, which was rejected. Our sense is that these authors ignored scientific input during that editorial process, and are focused mainly on creating and sustaining a controversy. We will share a copy of this manuscript with them informally, seeking their input.

Thank you in advance for your consideration of our paper.

On behalf of myself and eighteen co-authors, sincerely,



Peter B. Kelemen  
Arthur D. Storke Professor  
Dept. of Earth & Environmental Sciences  
[peterk@LDEO.columbia.edu](mailto:peterk@LDEO.columbia.edu)